

The Regional Municipalities of Durham and York

MINUTES of the JOINT WASTE MANAGEMENT GROUP (JWVG) for the DURHAM/YORK RESIDUAL WASTE STUDY

TUESDAY, JANUARY 8, 2008

A meeting of the Joint Waste Management Group for the Durham/York Residual Waste Study was held on Tuesday, January 8, 2008 in the Seminar Room, York Region Administrative Centre, Newmarket, Ontario, beginning at 1:00 p.m.

Present: Councillor S. Crawford, Town of Ajax, Durham Region
Councillor G. Emm, Town of Whitby, Durham Region
Councillor G. Landon, Town of Markham, York Region
Councillor C. Trim, Municipality of Clarington, Durham Region, Co-Chair
Councillor D. Wheeler, Town of Georgina, York Region
I. Gray, Resident, Town of Newmarket, Newmarket Environmental Advisory Committee
B. Mersey, Resident, Town of Markham, Markham Conservation Committee

Alternates

Present: Regional Chair R. Anderson, Durham Region (Arrived 1:30 p.m.)
Regional Chair B. Fisch, York Region
Councillor N. Pidwerbecki, City of Oshawa, Durham Region
Councillor G. Rosati, City of Vaughan, York Region
Councillor V. Spatafora, Town of Richmond Hill, York Region

Absent: Councillor M. Ferri, City of Vaughan, York Region, Co-Chair
Councillor J. Heath, Town of Markham, York Region
Councillor R. Johnson, City of Pickering, Durham Region
L. Burt, Resident, Township of Scugog, DEAC Representative
M. Evans, Resident, Township of Brock
J. McGinnis, Resident, City of Pickering, Durham Conservation Centre
S. Perrella, Resident, City of Vaughan, Vaughan CARES

Also

Present: Councillor J. Abernethy, Municipality of Clarington, Durham Region
Councillor R. Hooper, Municipality of Clarington, Durham Region

Staff

Present: A. Bacopoulos, Solid Waste, York/Durham Regions
J. Bell, County of Northumberland
L. Bigioni, Director, Government Services, York Region
A. Campbell, Director, Solid Waste Management, York Region

C. Curtis, Commissioner of Works, Durham Region
M. Januszkiewicz, Director of Waste Management Services, Durham Region
S. Love, Legal Counsel, York Region
N. MacDonald, Solid Waste Management, York Region
B. Macgregor, Chief Administrative Officer, York Region
E. Mastrangelo, Administrative Assistant, Durham Region
J. McKay, Jacques Whitford
D. Merriman, GENIVAR
C. Ollson, Health Impact Assessment Officer, Jacques Whitford
J. Paquette, Works Communications Officer, Durham Region
D. Payne, Consultant, Jacques Whitford
A. Quinn, GENIVAR
K. Spitzig, Solid Waste Management, York Region
E. Wilson, Senior Counsel, York Region
K. Price, Committee Secretary

Councillor C. Trim, Durham Region, chaired the meeting.

1. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

MOVED by Councillor Emm,
"THAT the agenda, as presented, be approved."
CARRIED

2. ADOPTION OF MINUTES

MOVED by Councillor Crawford,
"THAT the minutes of the Tuesday, September 25, 2007 Joint Waste
Management Group meeting be adopted."
CARRIED

3. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

There were no declarations of interest.

4. BUSINESS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES

There was no business arising from the minutes.

5. CORRESPONDENCE

- 1) Correspondence (a printed copy of the following correspondence was previously distributed to all members of the Committee and was also available at the meeting for review upon request):
 - a. Gaston Morin, dated September 30, 2007

- b. Maureen Dingman, dated September 30, 2007
- c. Carl Zmozynski, dated October 1, 2007
- d. Maureen Dingman, dated October 1, 2007
- e. Tracey Ali, dated October 2, 2007
- f. Keith and Shirley Crago, dated October 3, 2007
- g. Stewart and Judy Dayes, dated October 3, 2007
- h. Willis Barraball, dated October 4, 2007
- i. Keith and Shirley Crago, dated October 7, 2007
- j. Ron Campbell, dated October 11, 2007
- k. Elaine and Vincent Ho, dated October 11, 2007
- l. Stephanie Adams, dated October 11, 2007
- m. Reverend Christopher Greaves, dated October 13, 2007
- n. Benjamin Fuller, dated October 13, 2007
- o. John Oates, dated October 14, 2007
- p. Kelly Melanson, dated October 14, 2007
- q. Leslie Heinrichs, dated October 14, 2007
- r. Roberta Brannan, dated October 18, 2007
- s. Martin de Rond, Town of Ajax, dated October 23, 2007
- t. Mabel M. Low, dated October 23, 2007
- u. Kristin D. McKinnon, dated Rutherford – October 24, 2007
- v. Robert D. Cullen, dated October 24, 2007
- w. Stephanie Adams, dated October 24, 2007
- x. Betty Robinson, dated October 30, 2007
- y. Randol Tang, dated October 31, 2007
- z. Louis Bertrand, dated November 5, 2007
- aa. Louis Bertrand, dated November 12, 2007
- bb. Arthur D. Margison, dated November 13, 2007
- cc. Jacqueline Muccio, dated November 15, 2007
- dd. Charlie and Irene Briden, dated November 15, 2007
- ee. Robert W. Fillion, ACFO, dated November 20, 2007
- ff. Kristin D. McKinnon-Rutherford, dated November 21, 2007
- gg. Brian Thompson, dated November 23, 2007
- hh. Kristin D. McKinnon-Rutherford, dated November 23, 2007
- ii. Members of the Ebenezer, Maple Grove Pastoral Charge of the United Church of Canada, dated November 23, 2007
- jj. Marc Tepfenhart, dated November 26, 2007
- kk. Kristin D. McKinnon-Rutherford, dated November 26, 2007
- ll. John Newell, dated November 29, 2007
- mm. Linda Gasser, dated December 3, 2007
- nn. Louis Bertrand and Jeanette van Loon, dated December 3, 2007
- oo. Maureen Dingman, dated December 3, 2007
- pp. Nancy Rutherford, dated December 4, 2007
- qq. Dave Renaud, dated December 4, 2007
- rr. Doug Anderson, dated December 5, 2007
- ss. Dayle Turner, dated December 5, 2007
- tt. A. Davidson, dated December 5, 2007

- uu. Barry Bracken, dated December 6, 2007
- vv. Linda Gasser, dated December 6, 2007
- ww. Paul, dated Andre Larose, dated December 6, 2007
- xx. Paul, dated Andre Larose, dated December 7, 2007
- yy. Wendy Bracken, dated December 10, 2007
- zz. John Newell, dated December 10, 2007
- aaa. John Newell, dated December 11, 2007
- bbb. Patti Barrie, Clarington, dated December 11, 2007
- ccc. Kristin D. McKinnon-Rutherford (2 emails), dated December 12, 2007
- ddd. Kristin D. McKinnon-Rutherford (2 emails), dated December 14, 2007
- eee. Doug Anderson, dated January 3, 2008
- fff. Rosemary Davies, dated December 12, 2007 (forwarded by Mayor Abernethy, Clarington)

MOVED by Councillor Johnson,
"THAT Correspondence Items a. to fff. inclusive, be received for
information."

CARRIED

6. PRESENTATION BY PEEL EFW FACILITY PUBLIC LIAISON COMMITTEE

Jayne Pilot and Clive Ford, Co-Chairs of the Algonquin Power Peel Public Liaison Committee and Peter Bulionis, P.Eng., Algonquin Power Systems Inc., outlined the background and reasons for the Public Liaison Committee. Ms. Pilot informed the Committee that the Public Liaison Committee is a partnership between the public, the government and industry. An overview of the Waste to Energy Facility and process was also provided, including waste delivery, waste storage/sorting, thermal combustors, steam to electricity, air pollution control and emission monitoring and testing, and combustor ash treatment.

Questions relating to monitoring and how often emissions testing was performed were raised and responded to by Ms. Pilot, Mr. Ford and Mr. Bulionis.

D. Merriman informed the Committee that monitoring is done continuously and that different facilities have different requirements depending on the conditions of approval. Additional information was provided in the presentation regarding the Recommendation of the Consultants' Preferred Site (see item 9 below).

Chris Ollson, Health Impact Assessment Officer, Jacques Whitford, responded to questions relating to soil testing and establishing a base line.

7. PRESENTATION OF DECEMBER 2007 POLLING RESULTS BY IPSOS REID

Martin Hrobsky, Senior Research Manager of Ipsos Reid Public Affairs, provided the Committee with an overview of the methodology used to conduct the survey

among residents of York Region and Durham Region, on behalf of Durham and York Regions. The survey was conducted to gauge awareness and opinions regarding the building of a thermal facility to manage waste from the Regions. Mr. Hrobsky then reviewed the key findings.

Questions and comments were responded to by Mr. Hrobsky concerning the survey and in particular relating to complaints received from the survey participants, how the participants were selected and how the questions on the survey were selected.

8. DELEGATIONS

MOVED by Councillor Pidwerbecki,

"THAT the rules of procedure be waived to allow Dr. Paul Connett an extra five minutes to make his delegation ."

CARRIED

a) LINDA GASSER, 7421 BEST ROAD, ORONO, LOB 1MO, REGARDING THE DURHAM/YORK ENERGY FROM WASTE ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT STUDY

Ms. Gasser commented on process issues relating to the Environmental Assessment and site selection, which she felt were flawed. She also felt that all future meetings of the JWMG should be held in Durham to accommodate the residents from Durham affected by the preferred site.

b) WAYNE ELLIS, DURHAM, REGARDING THE DURHAM/YORK WASTE SURVEY CONDUCTED BY IPSOS REID

Mr. Ellis commented on the telephone poll conducted by Ipsos Reid. He had concerns relating to the manner in which the survey was conducted and the types of questions asked.

c) BARRY BRACKEN, 15030 OLD SIMCOE ROAD, PORT PERRY, L9L 1K4, REGARDING THE DURHAM/YORK ENERGY FROM WASTE ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT STUDY

Mr. Bracken requested the Committee not endorse the recommendation of the Consultants' Preferred Site of Clarington 01 and referred to the Step 7 Evaluation of Short List of Sites, Clarington Report PSD-141-07 and the resolution passed by Clarington Council on December 10, 2007.

- d) WENDY BRACKEN, 41 LILLIAN CRESCENT, NEWCASTLE, L1B 1G3,
REGARDING THE DURHAM/YORK ENERGY FROM WASTE ENVIRONMENTAL
ASSESSMENT STUDY

Ms. Bracken requested the Committee not endorse the recommendation of the Consultants' Preferred Site of Clarington 01 and referred to the Step 7 Evaluation of Short List of Sites and Clarington Report PSD-141-07. She had concerns with air emissions and specifically referred to the table taken from the National Pollutant Release Inventory from Environment Canada and Tables 3.7 and 3.9 containing the same data in Appendix A of the 'Draft Report, Thermal Treatment Facility Site Selection Process Results of Step 7: Evaluation of Short-List of Sites and Identification of Consultants' Recommended Preferred Site', dated September 2007.

Ms. Bracken responded to questions from the Committee.

- e) JUNE DAVIES, 6080 LAKE RIDGE ROAD, UXBRIDGE, L9P 1R4, REGARDING
THE DURHAM/YORK ENERGY FROM WASTE ENVIRONMENTAL
ASSESSMENT STUDY

Ms. Davies urged leadership be taken in the waste reduction/diversion component, not just the residential sector, but also engaging greater public and corporate involvement and commitment.

- f) DOUG ANDERSON, 111 EUCLID STREET, WHITBY, ONTARIO, REGARDING
THE DURHAM/YORK ENERGY FROM WASTE ENVIRONMENTAL
ASSESSMENT STUDY

Mr. Anderson stated he was opposed to incineration and that proper implementation of the 3Rs is the only sustainable way to eliminate waste. He provided a hand-out regarding "An alternative approach to Recycling/Waste Management, increasing consumer stewardship at the individual household/business level".

Mr. Anderson responded to questions from the Committee.

- g) PAUL ANDRE LAROSE, 435 GLENDALE AVENUE, OSHAWA, L1J 3H9,
REGARDING THE DURHAM/YORK ENERGY FROM WASTE ENVIRONMENTAL
ASSESSMENT PROJECT

Mr. Larose commented on the site selection process and the associated issues of increased traffic, residual ashes and the surrounding population density of the

selected site. Mr. Larose concluded by stating that Site 01 is not a suitable location for a waste disposal plant.

h) DR. PAUL CONNETT, ST. LAWRENCE UNIVERSITY, CANTON, NEW YORK
REGARDING THE DURHAM/YORK ENERGY FROM WASTE ENVIRONMENTAL
ASSESSMENT PROJECT

Dr. Connett made a powerpoint presentation and addressed issues relating to the Region's economy and the public health dangers in the chosen location if the energy from waste facility were to be implemented at the recommended site.

Dr. Connett responded to questions from the Committee.

i) KRISTIN ROBINSON, 2225 HOLT ROAD, BOWMANVILLE, ONTARIO, L1C 3K7
REGARDING THE DURHAM/YORK ENERGY FROM WASTE ENVIRONMENTAL
ASSESSMENT PROJECT

Ms. Robinson commented that with respect to the site selection, East Gwillimbury and Clarington 01 should not have been considered in the same category with respect to air quality. She also had concerns with the Energy from Waste Facility in Brampton. Ms. Robinson suggested that more education was needed for the public to deal with waste diversion and recycling and that the government should be lobbied for more stringent laws for extended producer responsibility.

Ms. Robinson responded to questions from the Committee.

Mr. Ollson, informed the Committee that a site specific risk assessment with additional information was underway which would take into consideration the baseline assessment and existing conditions.

MOVED by Councillor Emm,

"THAT the delegations be received for information and referred to staff."

CARRIED

The Committee recessed at 3:30 p.m. for a short break and resumed the meeting at 3:43 p.m.

8. JOINT WASTE MANAGEMENT GROUP MOTION REGARDING THE IDENTIFICATION OF CONSULTANT'S RECOMMENDED PREFERRED SITE

At the request of the Committee, Jim McKay, Jacques Whitford, gave a presentation on the Consultants' Recommendation of the Preferred Site Location for the Durham/York Energy-from Waste Facility.

Mr. McKay provided an overview of the Clarington 01 site advantages, disadvantages and potential disadvantages. He noted the provincial approvals that are required. Mr. McKay reviewed the public information sessions and agency consultations that were held and the evaluation process undertaken for the public concerns. He informed the Committee that the conclusion of the Consultants and Regional staff was to recommend Clarington 01 Site as the preferred alternative.

Mr. McKay noted that all documents, including the Final Consultants Recommendation and Record of Consultation on the Thermal Facility Site Identification and Evaluation "Identification of the Consultants Recommended Preferred Site", dated December 2007, are available on the Durham/York website at www.durhamyorkwaste.ca.

Mr. McKay responded to questions from the Committee. He stated that additional information relating to health considerations would be submitted with the Request for Proposals for the vendor in April 2008. The Request for Proposals will be issued in April and evaluated in the fall of 2008. Once the technology is selected, additional site specific testing will be done.

MOVED by Councillor Johnson,

"THAT the Memorandum to the Joint Waste Management Group from Andrew Campbell, Director, Solid Waste Management and Administration, Environmental Services Department, York Region and Mirka Januszkiewicz, Director, Waste Management Services, Works Department, Durham Region, dated January 8, 2008, regarding the Durham/York Residual Waste Environmental Assessment Study, Recommendation of the Preferred Site Location, Durham/York Energy from Waste Facility, be received; and that:

1. The inclusion of the consultant team's recommendation of the preferred site, Clarington 01, as the location of the Durham/York energy from waste facility for submission to the Ministry of the Environment as part of the Individual Environmental Assessment be endorsed; and

2. The endorsement be communicated to Durham's Works Committee, York's Solid Waste Management Committee and the Councils of both Regions for consideration.

CARRIED

10. JOINT WASTE MANAGEMENT GROUP MOTION REGARDING THE REQUEST FOR QUALIFICATIONS – DESIGN, BUILD AND OPERATE AN ENERGY FROM WASTE FACILITY

Mirka Januskiewicz, Director, Waste Management Services, Durham, presented an overview of the Request for Qualifications process and proponent submissions. She informed the Committee that an evaluation of the submissions resulted in the selection of five proponents that have been pre-qualified subject to the ratification of the Durham and York Regional Councils.

Ms. Januskiewicz responded to questions from the Committee.

MOVED by Councillor Wheeler,

"THAT the Memorandum to the Joint Waste Management Group from Andrew Campbell, Director, Solid Waste Management and Administration, Environmental Services Department, York Region and Mirka Januskiewicz, Director, Waste Management Services, Works Department, Durham Region, dated January 8, 2008, regarding the Durham/York Residual Waste Environmental Assessment Study, Request for Qualifications – Design, Build and Operate an Energy from Waste Facility, be received; and that:

1. The short-list of pre-qualified vendors of thermal waste treatment technology and the subsequent issuance of the Request for Proposals for the design, construction and operation of the energy from waste facility be endorsed and referred to the Durham Works Committee and the York Solid Waste Management Committee; and
2. Prior to the issuance of a Request for Proposals, staff prepare an updated business case for Council approval.

CARRIED

10. OTHER BUSINESS

Regional Chair Anderson suggested that in view of the preferred site being located in Clarington, the Committee consider that all future meetings be held in the Region of Durham.

Regional Chair Fisch noted that York Region is a 50% partner in the Environmental Assessment Study and that half of the Committee membership is from York Region.

The Committee agreed that it would be appropriate to hold the next few meetings in Durham Region and that the location of future meetings would be determined at the discretion of the Committee.

11. NEXT MEETING: MARCH 4, 2008

Following the meeting, it was determined that the next meeting of the JWVG should be scheduled for Tuesday, March 4, 2008 at 1:00 p.m. and not February 5, 2008 as previously listed in the Agenda. The meeting will be held in the Region of Durham.

12. ADJOURNMENT

MOVED by Councillor Emm,
"THAT the meeting be adjourned."
CARRIED

The meeting adjourned at 3:36 p.m.

K. Price, Committee Secretary

C. Trim, Chair
Joint Waste Management Group